



Pluricultural Perspectives on Plurilingual Identity: A Critical Intersectional Literature Review

REBECCA SCHMOR, University of Toronto

ABSTRACT. Drawing on a methodology of intersectionality, this critical literature review synthesizes existing knowledge on the topic of plurilingual identity while critically prioritizing studies produced by traditionally marginalized scholars from historically excluded contexts. The first part draws on a larger set of articles (n=114) written in French, English, German, Spanish, Italian, and Portuguese to investigate who(se research) is represented in this topic area. The second part explores what themes are present in a subset of 18 studies which represent the least cited articles written by female scholars in peripheralized contexts. The first part of this review finds that research on plurilingual identity is predominantly written in English and French and underrepresented in Italian and Spanish. Findings from the 114 articles show a dominance of female authors affiliated with core countries writing on (neo) liberal themes. The second part of this review reveals that, within the subset of 18 articles, there was no evidence of a connected theory or demarcated definition of plurilingual identity. As such, this review identifies the need for a distinct conceptualization of plurilingual identity itself while contributing to the development of intersectional methodology and advocating for increased transparency of author positionality.

RÉSUMÉ. S'appuyant sur une méthodologie d'intersectionnalité, cette revue critique de la littérature synthétise les connaissances existantes sur le thème de l'identité plurilingue, tout en priorisant les études produites par des chercheurs traditionnellement marginalisés et de contextes historiquement exclus. La première partie s'appuie sur un ensemble plus vaste d'articles (n = 114) rédigés en français, anglais, allemand, espagnol, italien et portugais pour déterminer qui est représenté dans ce domaine thématique. La deuxième partie explore les thèmes présents dans un sous-ensemble de 18 études qui représentent les articles les moins cités écrits par des chercheuses dans des contextes périphériques. La première partie de cette revue constate que la recherche sur l'identité plurilingue est majoritairement rédigée en anglais et en français et sous-représentée en italien et en espagnol. Les résultats des 114 articles montrent une prédominance d'auteurs féminins affiliés aux pays dominants qui écrivent sur des thèmes (néo)libéraux. La deuxième partie de cette revue révèle que, dans le sous-ensemble de 18 articles, il n'y avait aucune preuve d'une théorie connexe ou d'une définition précise de l'identité plurilingue. Par conséquent, cette revue identifie le besoin d'une conceptualisation distincte de l'identité plurilingue elle-même, tout en contribuant au développement d'une méthodologie intersectionnelle et en plaidant pour une transparence accrue de la positionnalité de l'auteur.

Keywords: *Plurilingualism, Pluriculturalism, Identity, Intersectionality.*



INTRODUCTION

A literature review is a political act. In reviewing literature, certain voices, ideas, and research are often unintentionally excluded based on a variety of factors such as the language of publication, accessibility to studies, and publication criteria. Such hegemonic factors ultimately influence the representation of knowledge in a given field. This literature review is an *intentional* political act, aiming to include a diverse intersection of underrepresented literature on plurilingual identity in pluricultural contexts. The intersections and limits of my own plurilingual and pluricultural identity are intimately integrated into this review. That is, this review is shaped by my positionality as a White female researcher with reading proficiency in English, Spanish, German, Italian, French, and Portuguese. It is also shaped by my personal understanding of the concept of plurilingualism, which I view as a vision of language use and development that prioritizes the inclusion of diverse and integrated ways of knowing and being, while recognizing the complexity of linguistic and cultural identity.

In contrast to multilingualism, which refers to the simultaneous presence of multiple, separate languages (Piccardo, 2018), plurilingualism sees different languages, cultures, and repertoires as interconnected, dynamic, and valuable (Lau & Van Viegen, 2020; Piccardo, Germain-Rutherford & Lawrence, 2021). Valuing individuals' diverse and complex linguistic and cultural repertoires means validating plurilingual identities, which are increasingly common in situations of superdiversity (Galante & dela Cruz, 2021). Whether or not these plurilingual identities are recognized by (inter)national policies, educational curricula, or individuals themselves remains a critical issue. As such, this literature review aims to synthesize existing knowledge on the topic of plurilingual identity while critically prioritizing studies produced by traditionally marginalized scholars from historically excluded contexts.

To this end, I have developed and applied a methodology of intersectionality (Crenshaw, 2017; Hillsburg, 2013), which foregrounds multiple sources of power and oppression in relation to intersecting identity categories (Collins & Bilge, 2020), in my selection of literature on plurilingual identity. This intersectional selection of literature led to a critical analysis of *who* and *what* is represented in this topic area, as well as the *so what?*, presented below in parts one, two, and three, respectively. After describing the details of this methodology, in part one, I engage with a larger set of studies (n=114) to identify what languages, authors, countries, and themes are broadly represented in this narrow topic area. In part two, I synthesize and contrast the theories, methods, and findings from a smaller subset of studies (n=18) selected to ensure a diversity of intersectional research perspectives. Finally, in part three, I discuss the conclusions and implications of this review, suggesting existing patterns and future recommendations for research in this topic area.

METHODOLOGY

In this critical, intersectional review of pluricultural literature on plurilingual identity, I designed my search procedure, selection criteria, and analytical approach with the objective of identifying and including studies from scholars representing a diverse intersection of marginalized contexts and perspectives.

Phase 1: Broad Literature Search

In commencing a broad literature search, I first created a spreadsheet with tabs for the six languages in which I planned to conduct my search and prepared tables in each tab to input extracted information about the authors and articles. I then used the keywords plurilingual identity (English), *plurilingu identidad* (Spanish), *mehrsprachig*



Journal of Belonging, Identity, Language, and Diversity (J-BILD) /

Revue de langage, d'identité, de diversité et d'appartenance (R-LIDA)

2023 • Vol. 7(1) • 107 - 124 • ISSN 2561-7982 •



identität (German), *plurilingu identità* (Italian), *plurilingu identité* (French), and *plurilingu identidade* (Portuguese) to systematically search the databases Google Scholar, Bielefeld Academic Search Engine, Directory of Open Access Journals, and African Journals OnLine. The key words were chosen to allow for both the adjective and noun of plurilingual/ism to appear across the different languages, and the databases were selected to enable a relatively diverse retrieval of sources across international, multidisciplinary, and accessible search engines. These search engines were loaded until no more relevant results appeared; that is until there were no more articles with a combination of the keywords “plurilingual/ism” and “identity” in the title.

During this first phase, I retrieved and organized 114 relevant articles (



APPENDIX 1



APPENDIX 1) in the prepared spreadsheet, extracting and inputting information about author identities, number of citations, countries in/on which research was conducted, and broad themes explored (e.g., teacher education, language policy, etc.). I extracted this information from the titles, abstracts, stated university affiliations, and online author biographies associated with each article. Initially, I had intended to extract more information on author identities, drawing on Simpson's (2009) intersectionality wheel, such as nationality, skin colour, or age. However, after beginning to research author profiles, I realized that the only information I would be able to input for all 159 authors of the 114 articles was country of work affiliation and gender, the latter based on a limited interpretation of female and male given names in the cultures represented by the six search languages. This limitation will be discussed further in the implications section of this review. Once I had collected the available information on gender, citations, countries, and themes from the articles, I conducted numerical and thematic coding and categorization in the same spreadsheet in order to identify and analyze emergent findings from this larger set of articles.

Phase 2: Review of Subset of Studies

In a second phase, I employed two analytical tools to inform the selection of a subset of 18 articles from underrepresented scholars and contexts in order to review their theories, methods, and findings. The first tool I used was Chase-Dunn et al.'s (2000) world-systems list of core, semi-periphery, and periphery countries, which I employed to code the countries represented in the articles categorically. The second tool was Roberts et al.'s (2019) intersecting axes of privilege, domination, and oppression, which I used to identify intersectionally marginalized identities among the authors of the articles. Using these tools in conjunction with the number of article citations, I determined, for each language, which articles embodied the least represented and most marginalized people and places. For example, among the nine articles on plurilingual identity found in Spanish, I selected three: one written by two females on decolonial language education in Mozambique and Tanzania (periphery countries) with zero citations; one written by a female on teacher education in Ecuador (a periphery country) with zero citations; and one written by a female on Indigenous youth in Argentina (a semi-periphery country) with 13 citations. The other six articles in Spanish were written by four females and three males on various topics in the context of Spain/Europe, of which the three articles written by males had a total of 32 citations, and the remaining three written by females had four citations. I give this example to detail both the procedure and intention behind this critical, intersectional approach, which I applied systematically to the sets of articles for each language, selecting a total of three studies per language. In choosing to select an equal number of articles for each language, I intentionally included a disproportionate percentage of underrepresented languages. That is, for the language with the least amount of articles retrieved - Portuguese with four articles - there was a 75% inclusion rate while the language with the most articles retrieved - French with 38 - had only 8% of sources included in this review.

Phase 3: Analysis of Findings

A third and final step of this methodology was the analysis and interpretation of findings from both phase one and phase two, which are presented and discussed below. This discussion necessarily reflects my own identity as a White, female, cisgender, Canadian-born teacher and researcher who also identifies as a critical, plurilingual, and pluricultural advocate and ally of diversity, equity, and inclusion.



PART 1: Who(SE RESEARCH) IS REPRESENTED?

Drawing on data collected during phase one of this review, the following details findings on who(se research) is currently represented in studies (n=114) on plurilingual identity across six languages. It does so through an analysis of the language of publication, number of citations, gender of the author(s), countr(ies) of affiliation, and dominant article themes. The findings reveal an overwhelming representation of female authors writing from core countries on themes of education, theory, national identity, migration, and policy.

In terms of the language of publication, there is a clear dominance of French (n=38), English (n=34), and German (n=23) language literature. Research written in Spanish (n=9), Italian (n=6), and Portuguese (n=4) is underrepresented in this topic area. The number of articles in a given language did not, however, correspond to the percentage of citations of those articles across the six languages. In fact, the language with the lowest number of total articles - Portuguese - represented the highest number of citations at 435. Meanwhile, English language articles were cited 409 times; French articles 322 times; German 255 times; Spanish 49; and Italian 15. These juxtaposing metrics highlight some of the complexities of language representation, suggesting that presence does not equal impact: despite there being only four articles on plurilingual identity in Portuguese, one of these articles was cited 408 times. Further, although more articles were written on this topic in French, English articles were cited more often, indicating a pronounced hierarchization of research languages even among a group of languages that all share a history of colonialism.

In terms of gender, despite the historical exclusion of women from research activities, females represented 71% of all authorship across the six language groups. Further, in the 11 instances of mixed-gender authorship, 73% of these pairings included a female first author. Only in the Italian language literature were males (n=5) represented more than females (n=3). Female or male, the 159 authors were predominantly affiliated with contexts of core countries (70%), followed by periphery (24%) and semi-periphery (6%) countries, with no significant correlation between gender and countr(ies) of affiliation. What is significant here is, on the one hand, the dominance of a traditionally underrepresented gender and, on the other hand, the hegemony of politically and economically powerful countries in the representation of research.

A thematic analysis of this research (Table 1) reveals, in the following order, dominant themes related to language theory; national identity; teacher education; language education; sociolinguistics; (im)migration; and language policy. Each of these themes was represented in 5-10% of the overall articles reviewed. The themes that were represented in 3-5% of the articles included culture; language varieties; neurolinguistics; heritage language learning; agency; Otherness; and intercomprehension. Less dominant though important themes included racism, indigeneity, equity, native speakerism, intersectionality, and social inclusion, each of which was represented in a single article. While this concise thematic analysis evidences the fact that critical themes remain largely underrepresented in this research area, the following section of this review aims to represent traditionally marginalized research voices and perspectives.

Theme	Frequency
Language theory	12
National identity	11
Teacher education	10



Language education	9
Sociolinguistics	8
(Im)migration	6
Language policy	6
Culture	5
Language varieties	5
Neurolinguistics	4
Heritage language learning	4
Agency	3
Otherness	3
Intercomprehension	3
Racism	1
Indigeneity	1
Equity	1
Native speakerism	1
Intersectionality	1
Social inclusion	1

Table 1: Literature Themes in Descending Order of Frequency

PART 2: WHAT THEORIES, METHODS, AND FINDINGS ARE REPRESENTED?

From a subset of 18 studies selected according to the criteria for identifying underrepresented authors and contexts as described in the methodology section, it was found that theories were often not explicitly stated. Moreover, there was no evidence of a connected theory of plurilingual identity. Further, there was a 55-45 split between empirical and non-empirical studies, and the empirical studies differed greatly in their choice of methods. Finally, findings reflected that plurilingualism impacts collective, immigrant, and teacher identity formation processes in interconnected yet distinct ways.

In terms of theory, several of the reviewed studies did not explicitly state the use of a theoretical framework (Alzati, 2005; Eren, 2021; Feijó, 2008; Korjeh & Lachkar, 2021; Ouhassine, 2014; Syzdykbayeva, 2016; Titone, 1982). Of these, a couple of studies reflected more liberal theoretical underpinnings with a focus on nation-state building through plurilingual policy in the Gagauzia Autonomous Region (Eren, 2021) and Kazakhstan (Syzdykbayeva, 2016). Others projected a more postcolonial or critical bent, for example, in a historical analysis of colonial relations and naming practices in Timor Leste (Feijó, 2008), in a semiolinguistic analysis of urban graffiti



expressing civil resistance in Lebanon (Korjeh & Lachkar, 2021), and in a corpus analysis of the emergent dominance of Algerian Arabic over the French language in advertisements in Algeria (Ouhassine, 2014).

Another portion of the selected studies explicitly drew on identity theories, conceptualizing identity as fluid, non-static, and hybrid in contexts of migration, such as Russian and Brazilian immigrants in Germany (Brito, 2016; Meng & Protassova, 2015) or Italian immigrants in Portugal (Griani, 2017). Raimondi (2015) drew on social identity theory in analyzing personal onomastics/naming practices in the Aosta Valley region of Italy, and Churuchumbi Chachalo (2018) developed a theory of teacher identity in her study with plurilingual teacher candidates in Ecuador. A plurilingual theoretical framework was employed in both a study of online youth identity construction in Mauritius (Auckle, 2017) and a review of plurilingualism, interculturality, and identity in educational contexts in Brazil (Krause-Lemke & Patino-Santos, 2020). Postcolonial frameworks informed a contrastive historical analysis of bilingual education in Mozambique and Tanzania (Alejo Jara, 2016) and a theoretical deconstruction of culture and identity by a researcher in Luxembourg (Hu, 2003). Finally, a sociolinguistic theoretical framework was applied to a study of the language practices of indigenous future teacher educators in Northern Argentina (Unamuno, 2011), and a framework of constructivism was used in a study of the plurilingual identities of English language teachers in Indonesia (Hardianti et al. 2021).

While there is a notable presence of theories of identity, plurilingualism, and postcoloniality across these studies, what is not found is a united theory of (postcolonial) plurilingual identity itself. Also missing is the application of critical or decolonial theoretical frameworks which could challenge and strengthen the analysis and interpretation of results and expand methodological options beyond traditional analytical tools and collection methods.

The methods used in the selected studies ranged in qualitative and quantitative orientation, with no significant collective preference. More significantly, just slightly more than half (55%) of the studies included empirical results. The other 45% of studies represented a combination of book chapters, journal forewords or afterwords, and non-empirical journal articles. These studies supported their arguments through historical analysis (Alejo Jara, 2016; Alzati, 2005; Eren, 2021; Feijó, 2008; Syzdykbayeva, 2016) or conceptual analysis (Hu, 2003; Krause-Lemke & Patino-Santos, 2020; Titone, 1982). A greater diversity of methods was found among the empirical studies, which included a variety of qualitative, mixed, and multiple methods. In alphabetical order, Auckle (2017) conducted an analysis of the chat logs of six adolescent Mauritian communicating on WhatsApp, Viber, and Facebook Messenger over a period of 6 months. Brito (2016) interviewed 22 Brazilian immigrants living in Germany; Churuchumbi Chachalo (2018) conducted a class survey and follow-up interviews with select Ecuadorian teacher candidates; and Griani (2017) completed a document analysis and a survey of the language habits and attitudes of Italian immigrants in Portugal. Drawing on a mixed methods design, Hardianti et al. (2021) developed a survey of 64 Indonesian teacher candidates and selected five focus group participants to draw and describe their plurilingual profiles. Korjeh & Lachkar (2021) also utilized artistic representations in a photo analysis of plurilingual graffiti, indicating the changing identity of Beirut.

Meanwhile, Meng and Protassova (2015) based their study on the identity of a single plurilingual participant through a language biography which included German/Russian language interviews and a document analysis of the participant's public work as an "Integrationsarbeiterin" (immigration worker). Ouhassine (2014) created and explored a corpus of 200 individual advertisements photographed across different Algerian villages. Raimondi (2015) similarly developed and analyzed a database, in this case, of 5000 names recorded in a region of Italy bordered by France and Switzerland. In contrast, Unamuno (2011) drew on a collection of interview records, discussion groups, observations, and responses to self-evaluation questionnaires from Argentinian university



students and faculty who communicated using four language varieties. The variety of methods adopted across the different studies reflects the diversity of their authors, contexts and, ultimately, findings.

The findings of the 18 studies on plurilingual identity can be categorized into thematic groupings of collective, immigrant, and teacher identity. In terms of the formation of collective identity, plurilingual language policies were argued to be a way to support societal diversity (Syzykbayeva, 2016) and promote national unity (Eren, 2021). Within a nation or region, the semiotic presence of collective plurilingualism, seen through graffiti (Korjeh & Lachkar, 2021), names (Feijó, 2008; Raimondi, 2015), or advertisements (Ouhassine, 2014), was suggested to be an important representation of the diversity of current community members. It was also understood as an indication of changing linguistic and cultural groups of inhabitants or shifting relations among existing languages and ethnicities in a particular geographic location. In an online context, the expression of plurilingual identities through codeswitching was also found to be a creative and innovative demonstration of shared cultural and linguistic knowledge among youth (Auckle, 2017). Among immigrant groups, the role of family attitudes (Meng & Protassova, 2015), emotional/affective factors (Brito, 2016), and time spent abroad (Griani, 2017) were seen to be influential in the adoption of plurilingual and pluricultural identities. For the development of teacher identity, the studies identified: a) the importance of practical teaching experience in solidifying (plurilingual) values and attitudes presented in class (Churuchumbi Chachalo, 2018); b) the impact of educational evaluations or expectations in restricting language choice and use among plurilingual students and teachers (Unamuno, 2011); and c) the challenges of teachers identifying and describing their own plurilingual identities (Hardianti et al. 2021). Together, these findings suggest that the formation of plurilingual identities is a naturally occurring process that simultaneously requires intentional fostering at a national, educational, or personal level. The studies do not, however, define plurilingual identity itself or provide a clear indication of what constitutes a distinct plurilingual identity in a particular context.

PART 3: REPRESENTATION: SO WHAT?

Several conclusions and implications can be drawn from this critical, intersectional literature review on plurilingual identity in pluricultural contexts in relation to both the methodology and the results of the review.

As mentioned briefly in the methodology section above, the intersectional approach to this review was limited by a lack of accessible information on author identities. Beyond gender and geographic affiliation, it was not possible to collect and compare identifying information for all authors regarding other intersectional factors such as nationality, race, or age. While privacy becomes a natural consideration in the public provision of personal information, the documented importance of researcher positionality (Holmes, 2020; Jacobson & Mustafa, 2019; Milligan, 2016; Shivji, 2022) justifies a need for more transparency in order to locate and contextualize authorial intersectionality in relation to research. For example, some journals require an author biography with publication; a brief positionality statement could become standard practice. Another methodological limitation was the use of the world-systems model to select studies from traditionally marginalized or excluded contexts. While this tool was useful for categorizing core, semi-periphery, and periphery countries, it did not allow for an intersectional view of marginalization within the countries themselves. For instance, in the selection of three Spanish language studies, Spain was identified as a core country, Argentina as a semi-periphery country, and Ecuador as a periphery country. However, the Argentinian scholar was presumably a member of an indigenous community, which would represent a layer of intersectional oppression in this context (Roberts et al., 2019), while the Ecuadorian scholar could have belonged to a privileged racial or socioeconomic positioning. Likewise, one of the scholars from Spain



worked with the minority language community of Valencia. This community, belonging to an intranational context, arguably does not represent *core country* status but was excluded from the second part of this review. In this inclusion process, Roberts et al.'s (2019) intersecting axes of privilege, domination, and oppression served as an indispensable tool in challenging and supplementing the world systems model. Nonetheless, these difficulties highlight the need for an emphasis on complexity (Piccardo, 2017) and multiplicity in methodologies of intersectionality.

Indeed, the incorporation of multiple theoretical lenses or approaches was largely absent from the studies reviewed, in which theories of identity or plurilingualism remained notably segregated instead of integrated. While a unified theory of plurilingual identity does not appear to be entirely necessary in these studies, the opportunity to incorporate novel and innovative theoretical and conceptual approaches is evident. Also noticeable is the lack of empirical studies among the 18 underrepresented selections. This lack suggests either a preference for historical analysis or, more likely, an insufficiency of funding in these research contexts (Monteiro & Hirano, 2020), implying a need for increased dispersion of research funds, possibly through international collaborations that span core, semi-periphery, and periphery countries. Equally important as geographic representation is linguistic representation: the first phase of this review confirmed the privileged positioning of the French, English, and German languages in this research area, compared to Spanish, Italian, and Portuguese. This hierarchization of colonial linguistic privilege points to both the dire underrepresentation of historically minoritized languages in research and an additional intersectional barrier for scholars working in contexts where underrepresented languages are spoken. Further, the clear preference to publish - along with the increased likelihood of being cited - in languages like English and French contributes to a devaluation of other research languages (Curry & Lillis, 2007).

This review represents one possible approach to the intentional representation of underrepresented research contexts and the valorization of undervalued research languages. It also stresses the importance of developing plurilingual scholars, able to read academically in multiple and diverse languages. In my own case, my exploration of this topic is limited by my knowledge of primarily European languages, restricting the diversity of perspectives represented. On the other hand, I was able to draw on my existing plurilingual repertoire and utilize reading strategies of intercomprehension (Bonvino et al., 2018) in order to access underrepresented literature through Portuguese and French, which I do not speak or use on a regular basis. Representative of the dynamic and situated nature of plurilingualism (Piccardo & North, 2020), this critical, intersectional literature review is, in the end, a representation of my own plurilingual identity. This methodology, applied to other topics and languages by other researchers, is expected to produce diverse, intersectional results and representations.

CONCLUSION

This critical, intersectional literature review drew on a methodology of intersectionality to investigate pluricultural perspectives on plurilingual identity. That is, I retrieved, selected, and analyzed literature in English, Spanish, German, Italian, French, and Portuguese using three tools: Simpson's (2009) intersectionality wheel, Chase-Dunn et al.'s (2000) world-systems list of core, semi-periphery, and periphery countries, and Roberts et al.'s (2019) intersecting axes of privilege, domination, and oppression. In the first phase, I collected 114 articles on plurilingualism and identity across six languages to systematically extract and comparatively analyze information about the language of publication, number of citations, gender of the author(s), countr(ies) of affiliation, and



dominant article themes. This analysis revealed a predominant representation of female authors affiliated with core countries writing on themes of education, theory, national identity, migration, and policy.

In the second phase, I selected a subset of 18 studies representative of intersectionally underrepresented scholars and contexts and provided a contrastive synthesis of their theories, methods, and findings. Through this synthesis, I identified a gap in explicitly-stated theoretical frameworks as well as empirical methods. Meanwhile, I categorized findings into thematic groupings of identity, including collective, immigrant, and teacher identity. Finally, in part 3, I reported several conclusions and implications drawn from both the methodology and results of this review. With this, I suggested the need for a) greater transparency of authors' intersectional identities; b) the use of multiple and blended theoretical and methodological approaches; and c) increased representation and funding of traditionally marginalized and excluded scholars, languages, and research contexts. As a literature review is a political act, this literature review acted on intersectional methodology to advocate for the critical inclusion of pluricultural voices on plurilingual identity.

REFERENCES

- Alejo Jara, M. A. (2016). Lengua e identidad: aproximación a la educación plurilingüe en los casos de Mozambique y Tanzania. *Educational Research with Social Impact*, 16.
- Alzati, C. A. M. (2005). Identità nazionali e lingue di cultura nell'Europa centro-orientale. In *Europa plurilingue* Vita e Pensiero. 261-272.
- Auckle, T. (2017). Le choix des codes dans la construction identitaire des jeunes internautes à l'île Maurice: la place du plurilinguisme dans le domaine virtuel. *Cahiers Internationaux de Sociolinguistique*, 12(2),125-132.
- Bonvino, E., Fiorenza, E., & Cortés Velásquez, D. (2018). Observing strategies in intercomprehension reading: some clues for assessment in plurilingual settings. *Frontiers in Communication*, 29.
- Brito, K. S. (2016). Transdiferente Identitäten am Beispiel von mehrsprachigen brasilianischen Migranten in Deutschland. *Sprache und Identität–Philologische Einblicke*, 261.
- Chase-Dunn, C., Kawano, Y., & Brewer, B. D. (2000). Trade globalization since 1795: Waves of integration in the world-system. *American Sociological Review*, 77-95.
- Churuchumbi Chachalo, E. C. (2018). La práctica pre-profesional de ayudantía de cátedra y el desarrollo de la identidad profesional docente en los estudiantes de séptimo semestre de la carrera de Plurilingüe (Bachelor dissertation). *Universidad Central del Ecuador*.
<http://www.dspace.uce.edu.ec/handle/25000/17021>
- Collins, P. H., & Bilge, S. (2020). *Intersectionality*. John Wiley & Sons.
- Crenshaw, K. W. (2017). *On intersectionality: Essential writings*. The New Press.
- Curry, M. J., & Lillis, T. (2007). The dominance of English in global scholarly publishing. *International Higher Education*, 46.
- Eren, E. (2021). Language and Education Policies Based on National/Plurilingual Identity in Autonomous Republics: A Case Study of the Gagauzia Autonomous Region. *Education Quarterly Reviews*, 4(3).



- Feijó, R. G. (2008). Língua, nome e identidade numa situação de plurilinguismo concorrencial: o caso de Timor-Leste. *Etnográfica. Revista do Centro em Rede de Investigação em Antropologia*, 12(1), 143-172.
- Galante, A., & dela Cruz, J. W. N. (2021). Plurilingual and pluricultural as the new normal: An examination of language use and identity in the multilingual city of Montreal. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 1-16.
- Griani, S. (2017). Línguas, encontros e identidades: as dinâmicas do plurilinguismo e a comunidade italiana em Portugal (Doctoral dissertation). *Universidade de Lisboa*. <http://hdl.handle.net/10451/29994>
- Hardianti, H., Basri, M., & Sahril, S. (2021). Plurilingual Identities of ELT Students: A Preliminary Study. *TLEMC (Teaching and Learning English in Multicultural Contexts)*, 5, 102-113.
- Hillsburg, H. (2013). Towards a methodology of intersectionality: An axiom-based approach. *Atlantis: Critical Studies in Gender, Culture & Social Justice*, 36(1), 3-11.
- Holmes, A. G. D. (2020). Researcher Positionality--A Consideration of Its Influence and Place in Qualitative Research--A New Researcher Guide. *Shanlax International Journal of Education*, 8(4), 1-10.
- Hu, A. (2003). Mehrsprachigkeitsforschung, Identität-und Kulturtheorie: Tendenzen der Konvergenz. In *Plurilingualität und Identität: Zur Selbst-und Fremdwahrnehmung mehrsprachiger Menschen*. Stauffenburg Linguistik.
- Jacobson, D., & Mustafa, N. (2019). Social identity map: A reflexivity tool for practicing explicit positionality in critical qualitative research. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, 18, <https://doi.org/10.1177/160940691987007>
- Korjeh, R., & Lachkar, A. (2021). Formes d'expression à Beyrouth en 2020: de l'identité plurilingue à la libanaise. *Discursive forms: Memory and identity*, 188.
- Krause-Lemke, C., & Patino-Santos, A. (2020). Plurilinguismo, dinâmicas interculturais e identidades em contextos educativos. *Revista Interfaces*, 11(01), 1-11.
- Lau, S. M. C., & Van Viegen, S., (Eds). (2020). *Plurilingual pedagogies: Critical and creative endeavors for equitable language in education*. Springer.
- Meng, K., & Protassova, E. (2015). Mehrsprachigkeit und Identität: Vorstellung einer Integrationsarbeiterin. *Société Néophilologique*, 277-293.
- Milligan, L. (2016). Insider-outsider-inbetweener? Researcher positioning, participative methods and cross-cultural educational research. *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education*, 46(2), 235-250.
- Monteiro, K., & Hirano, E. (2020). A periphery inside a semi-periphery: The uneven participation of Brazilian scholars in the international community. *English for Specific Purposes*, 58, 15-29.
- Ouhassine, C. M. (2014). L'arabe algérien au cœur du bi-plurilinguisme urbain ou l'identité algérienne mise en mur. In *Colloque international des étudiants chercheurs en didactique des langues et en linguistique*.
- Piccardo, E. (2017). Plurilingualism as a catalyst for creativity in superdiverse societies: A systemic analysis. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 8, 2169.



- Piccardo, E. (2018). Plurilingualism: Vision, conceptualization, and practices. In *Handbook of Research and Practice in Heritage Language Education*. Springer. 207-225.
- Piccardo, E., & North, B. (2020). The dynamic nature of plurilingualism: Creating and validating CEFR descriptors for mediation, plurilingualism and pluricultural competence. In *Plurilingual pedagogies* Springer. 279-301.
- Piccardo, E., Germain-Rutherford, A., & Lawrence, G. (Eds.). (2021). *The Routledge handbook of plurilingual language education*. Routledge.
- Raimondi, G. (2015). Antoponimia plurilingue: storia della lingua e storia delle identità. un progetto di ricerca sull'onomastica personale e familiare in VDA. *Éducation et Sociétés Plurilingues*, 38, 15-24.
- Roberts, J. D., Mandic, S., Fryer, C. S., Brachman, M. L., & Ray, R. (2019). Between privilege and oppression: an intersectional analysis of active transportation experiences among Washington DC area youth. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*, 16(8), 1313.
- Shivji, N. A., Meade, O., Watts, K., & Lymn, J. S. (2022). Reflecting on 'insider' and 'outsider' positionality when undertaking culturally sensitive research with young Pakistani men: insights from a female researcher. *Nurse Researcher*, 30(2).
- Simpson, J. (2009). *Everyone belongs: A toolkit for applying intersectionality*. Canadian Research Institute for the Advancement of Women (CRIAOW).
- Syzdykbayeva, R. (2016). The role of languages in developing plurilingual identities in Kazakhstan. *NUGSE Research in Education*, 1(1), 15-19.
- Titone, R. (1982). L'educazione plurilingue come superamento del concetto razzistico di «identità culturale». *Rassegna Italiana di Linguistica Applicata*, 14(2), 189-192.
- Unamuno, V. (2011). Plurilinguismo e identidad entre jóvenes aborígenes chaqueños (Argentina). *Interacções*, 7(17).



APPENDIX 1

Table of 114 Articles with Author Names, Article Titles, and Years of Publication

#	Author(s)	Article	Year
1	Abendroth-Timmer & Hennig	Plurilingualism and multiliteracies: International research on identity construction in language education	2014
2	Alejo Jara	Lengua e Identidad: aproximación a la educación plurilingüe en los casos de Mozambique y Tanzania	2016
3	Alzati	Identità nazionali e lingue di cultura nell'Europa centro-orientale	2005
4	Arroyo	Variación lingüística e identidad en la España plurilingüe: una aproximación multidisciplinar	2008
5	Atika	Identité et plurilinguisme: analyse sociolinguistique des graffitis de la ville de M'sila	2020
6	Auckle	Le choix des codes dans la construction identitaire des jeunes internautes à l'Île Maurice: la place du plurilinguisme dans le domaine virtuel	2017
7	Azaoui	«C'est mieux mourir qu'oublier», ou de la complexité de l'identité plurilingue en construction chez trois EANA arméniens	2013
8	Bataller Català	Del concepto de lengua materna al de competencia plurilingüe. Representaciones de la identidad y la enseñanza multilingües a partir de biografías lingüísticas	2019
9	Beaven & Conacher	Conceptualising plurilingual identities in study abroad settings	2021
10	Becker	"I'm Always in This Conflict"—Students' Struggle of Plurilingual Identity Expression, Linguistic Insecurity, and Assimilation in Switzerland's Higher Education	2021
11	Bein	Mehrsprachige Identität. Sprach-und kulturwissenschaftliche Perspektiven auf die Romania und die Welt	2021
12	Benert	Babel en littérature: esquisse définitionnelle et réflexion sur les implications esthétiques, politiques et identitaires du plurilinguisme littéraire	2016
13	Berché	La construcción de una identidad plurilingüe y la autotraducción al castellano de La meitat de l'ànima de Carme Riera	2011
14	Bertelli	Intercomprensión e identidad cultural: consideraciones acerca de procesos interculturales en el aprendizaje receptivo plurilingüe	2016



15	Bertucci	Chronique «linguistique». L'identité plurilingue: un signe d'hypermodernité?	2007
16	Blahak & Winter	Deutsch-tschechische Mehrsprachigkeit im Wandel. Zur Tagung, Sprache und Identität. Deutsch in Tschechien heute 'an der Karls-Universität Prag	2013
17	Bochmann	Sprache und Identität in mehrsprachigen Regionen in Osteuropa-Theoretische und methodische Ausgangspositionen	2007
18	Brisson	Identité et multimodalité: le cas d'un élève plurilingue dans une école en milieu francophone minoritaire	2015
19	Brisson	Plurilingualism and transnational identities in a Francophone minority classroom	2018
20	Brito	Transdifferente Identitäten am Beispiel von mehrsprachigen brasilianischen Migranten in Deutschland	2016
21	Calvet	Identité et plurilinguisme	2001
22	Carrasco & Piccardo	Plurilinguisme, cultures et identités: la construction du savoir-être chez l'enseignant	2009
23	Cattacin & Losa	Plurilinguisme vécu et identité: pratiques et stratégies d'utilisation de la langue dans des contextes plurilingues suisses	2009
24	Churuchumbi Chachalo	La práctica pre-profesional de ayudantía de cátedra y el desarrollo de la identidad profesional docente en los estudiantes de séptimo semestre de la carrera de Plurilingüe, Facultad de Filosofía, Letras y Ciencias de la Educación, de la Universidad Central del Ecuador período lectivo	2018
25	Colombo, Ritter & Stopfner	Identity in social context: Plurilingual families in Baden-Wuerttemberg and South Tyrol	2020
26	Coracini	A celebração do outro: arquivo, memória e identidade: línguas (materna e estrangeira), plurilingüismo e tradução	2007
27	Corsi	Insight into plurilingual and pluricultural identity in multigenerational homes: a case study of three young adults	2020
28	Corti	Virus tropical en la clase de E/LE: cómo trabajar la narración visual, la identidad y el plurilingüismo con una novela gráfica	2017
29	Cots, Mitchell & Beaven	Structure and agency in the development of plurilingual identities in study abroad	2021
30	Dagenais, Brisson, Forte & André	Questioning Human and Material Boundaries in Plurilingual Identity Construction	2021



31	Dannerer, Franz & Ortner	„Da pendelt sich die Sprache automatisch so ein “: Sprachliche Identität, Akkommodation und Management von innerer und äußerer Mehrsprachigkeit bei Tiroler Privatvermietern	2017
32	Dondelinger & Wengler	Plurilinguisme et identité culturelle. Actes des assises européennes pour une éducation plurilingue	1995
33	Dreyfus & Juillard	Le plurilinguisme au Sénégal: Langues et identités en devenir	2005
34	Dumas	L'Autre bilingue (ou plurilingue) de naissance: stéréotypes d'une identité hors-normes	2011
35	e Sá & Melo-Pfeifer	Online Plurilingual Interaction: Identity Construction and Development of Plurilingual Competence in Students and Teachers: A Focus on Intercomprehension	2021
36	Eren	Language and Education Policies Based on National/Plurilingual Identity in Autonomous Republics: A Case Study of the Gagauzia Autonomous Region	2021
37	Feijó	Língua, nome e identidade numa situação de plurilinguismo concorrencial: o caso de Timor-Leste. Etnográfica	2008
38	Franz & Wildfeuer	Mehrsprachigkeit–Identität–Authentizität.	2021
39	Franz & Wildfeuer	Sprachliche Identität in mehrsprachigen Räumen-deutschbasierte Minderheitensprachen in Italien, der Ukraine und den USA	2021
40	Galante	Plurilingualism in linguistically diverse language classrooms: Respecting and validating student identity	2018
41	Galante & dela Cruz	Plurilingual and pluricultural as the new normal: an examination of language use and identity in the multilingual city of Montreal	2021
42	Gatsi & Delhaye	Représentations de l'identité pluriculturelle et épanouissement scolaire	2015
43	Goglia, Brambati & Mazza	Il soggetto plurilingue: interlingua, aspetti di neurolinguistica, identità e interculturalità	2004
44	Gonzales	La peur (babélique) de l'hétérogénéité ethno-linguistique dans une Europe en crise identitaire. Le « plurilinguisme » en question ?	2017
45	Griani	Línguas, encontros e identidades: as dinâmicas do plurilinguismo e a comunidade italiana em portugal	2017
46	Hackett-Jones	Developing plurilingual identity in third language classroom	2015



47	Hardianti, Basri & Sahril	Plurilingual Identities of ELT Students: A Preliminary Study	2021
48	Henriksen	Identity and Plurilingualism In Africa – the Case of Mozambique	2014
49	Hicham	Code-switching, plurilinguisme et identité linguistique au Maroc	2018
50	Hnízdo	Plurilingualism and European Identity. ALPPI Annual of Language & Politics and Politics of Identity	2007
51	Hnízdo	The Types of the European Plurilingualism: Gateways to Creation of Transnational Identities?	2008
52	Hu	Mehrsprachigkeitsforschung, Identität-und Kulturtheorie: Tendenzen der Konvergenz. Plurilingualität und Identität. Zur Selbst-und Fremdwahrnehmung mehrsprachiger Menschen	2003
53	Hu	Plurilingual identities	2018
54	Hu	Plurilinguale Identitäten? Entwicklungen in der Theoriebildung und empirische Forschungsergebnisse zur Mehrsprachigkeit an Schulen	2018
55	Jacob	Identität, Fremdsprachenlernen und Mehrsprachigkeit	2021
56	Jafrancesco	Apprendimento linguistico e costruzione dell'identità plurilingue: aspetti psicolinguistici	2009
57	Kalden	Mehrsprachigkeit und die Frage nach der'doppelten Identität': Ein Diskussionsansatz	2022
58	Keto	Konstruieren der sprachlichen Identität in einer neuen Umgebung: Persönliche Erfahrungen der Mehrsprachigkeit und der Multikulturalität sowie sprachlich-kulturelles Einleben von deutschen Migranten in Finnland	2015
59	Korjeh & Lachkar	Formes d'expression à Beyrouth en 2020: de l'identité plurilingue à la libanaise	2021
60	Krause-Lemke & Patino-Santos	Plurilinguismo, dinâmicas interculturais e identidades em contextos educativos	2020
61	Krumm	Die Bedeutung der Mehrsprachigkeit in den Identitätskonzepten von Migrantinnen und Migranten	2009
62	Krumm	Mehrsprachigkeit und Identität	2020
63	Lapresta & Huguet	A model of relationship between collective identity and language in pluricultural and plurilingual settings: Influence on intercultural relations	2008
64	Larryuy	L'école andorrane: une école plurilingue pour construire l'identité nationale	1998



65	Lauwo, Accurso & Rajagopal	Plurilingualism, Equity, and Pre-service Teacher Identity: Centring [Linguistic] Diversity in Teacher Education	2022
66	Lazali	Plurilinguisme, pluriculture et identité	2010
67	Lemos	Contexte plurilingue au Mozambique: quelle identité, quelle culture?	2011
68	Maddamsetti	Intersectional identities and teaching practice in an elementary general classroom: A case study of a plurilingual teacher candidate	2020
69	Marinov, Soulé & Cots	The Role of Context in Shaping Narratives of Plurilingual Identity	2021
70	Marques	Identité, Altéerité et Plurilinguisme dans Exilio Perturbado d' Urbano Tavares Rodrigues	2011
71	Meng & Protassova	Mehrsprachigkeit und Identität: Vorstellung einer Integrationsarbeiterin	2015
72	Meunier & Defays	Les locataires de Babel: l'identité à l'épreuve du plurilinguisme	2018
73	Moline	Approche biographique et sciences humaines: L'acquisition des langues comme processus de formation d'identité plurilingue/pluriculturelle	2009
74	Muller	Représentations, identité et apprentissage de l'allemand: une étude de cas en contexte plurilingue	1997
75	Narwutsch	Mehrsprachigkeit und Identität: Eine qualitative Analyse	2015
76	Nicolas & Stratilaki-Klein	Représentations identitaires et inclusion scolaire: l'opposition école/plurilinguisme	2018
77	Oliveri	Plurilinguisme et identité culturelle européenne	2009
78	Oppenrieder & Thurmair	Sprachidentität im Kontext von Mehrsprachigkeit	2003
79	Ouhassine	L'arabe algerien au coeur du bi-plurilinguisme urbain ou l'identité algerienne mise en mur	2014
80	Petri & Müller	Nazionalizzazione delle frontiere. La costruzione dell'identità nazionale nelle regioni plurilingue di confine	2001
81	Pinho	Plurilingual education and the identity development of pre-service English language teachers: An illustrative example	2019
82	Pinho & Andrade	Plurilingual awareness and intercomprehension in the professional knowledge and identity development of language student teachers	2009



83	Prasad	Beyond the mirror towards a plurilingual prism: Exploring the creation of plurilingual 'identity texts' in English and French classrooms in Toronto and Montpellier	2015
84	Puozzo Capron	Identité plurilingue, didactique monolingue	2011
85	Raimondi	Antonomimia plurilingue: storia della lingua e storia delle identità. un progetto di ricerca sull'onomastica personale e familiare in VDA	2015
86	Ramos & Claudio	Desarrollo y gestión de la identidad personal en el aula plurilingüe: hacia una educación intercultural	2019
87	Rey & Van den Avenne	Langue et identité en situation migratoire: identité ethnique, identité linguistique. 'A chacun son bambara'	1998
88	Rončević	Mehrsprachigkeit und affektive Aspekte der sprachlichen Identität	2021
89	Sangrà & Casals	Teacher identity construction and plurilingual competence: a longitudinal study about language teaching in multilingual contexts	2015
90	Sattler	Curriculum und Mehrsprachigkeit: Planung und Gestaltung sprachlicher Identität in Luxemburg	2022
91	Scandella	Mobilité, identité, autobiographie, représentation: fondements de notre recherche et liens avec le Précis du plurilinguisme et du pluriculturalisme: place de la langue-culture d'origine dans cet ouvrage de référence	2011
92	Schönhagen & Trebbe	Interkulturelle Kommunikation in einem mehrsprachigen Land: Sprachregionale Identität und massenmediale Repräsentation im Schweizer Fernsehen	2009
93	Shahabi	La construction identitaire en milieu plurilingue et pluriculturel: étude de la politique linguistique éducative des écoles européennes dans le contexte luxembourgeois	2013
94	Simon & Sandoz	Faire vivre et développer le plurilinguisme à l'école: les biographies langagières au cœur de la construction d'identités plurielles et du lien social	2008
95	Spaëth, Moore & Martinez	Plurilinguismes et enseignement. Identités en construction	2008
96	Stratilaki-Klein	Vers une grammaire de l'identité plurilingue: voix de soi dans le discours des élèves plurilingues	2016
97	Stratilaki	Plurilingualism, linguistic representations and multiple identities: Crossing the frontiers	2012
98	Stratilaki	Discourse, representation and language practices: Negotiating plurilingual identities and spaces	2013



99	Syzdykbayeva	The role of language policies in developing plurilingual identities in Kazakhstan	2016
100	Titone	L'educazione plurilingue come superamento del concetto razzistico di «identità culturale»	1982
101	Traverso	Positionnements identitaires multiples dans une réunion plurilingue: traces dans l'interaction et effets structurants	2011
102	Trenchs-Parera & Pastena	Exploring transcultural competence in the internationalised university classroom: the role of intercultural friendships and plurilingualism in the construction of a transcultural identity	2021
103	Tuynman	Identités plurilingues des enseignantes de FLE et modes d'enseignement	2014
104	Unamuno	Plurilinguismo e identidad entre jóvenes aborígenes chaqueños	2011
105	Van Deusen-Scholl	The negotiation of multilingual heritage identity in a distance environment: HLA and the plurilingual turn	2018
106	Veillette	Dynamiques identitaires de jeunes professionnels en milieu de travail plurilingue et multiethnique: études de cas de Québécois francophones et de Suisses romands	2004
107	Wernicke	Plurilingualism as agentive resource in L2 teacher identity	2018
108	Wharton	Plurilinguisme, identité et stratégies sociolinguistiques résilientes	2011
109	Winter	Mehrsprachigkeit und jüdische Identität. Deutsch-tschechische interkulturelle Transferprozesse im 19. Jahrhundert am Beispiel Siegfried Kappers	2017
110	Wittbrodt	» The Cruel Absurdity of the Letter › I««. Literarische Mehrsprachigkeit und Identität bei Michael Hamburger	2023
111	Wojtaszek	Migrationsbedingte Mehrsprachigkeit und ihr Einfluss auf die Identitätsbildung	2010
112	Zaragoza	Identity, motivation and plurilingualism in self-access centers	2011
113	Zarate	Constitution d'un capital plurilingue et économie d'une identité pluriculturelle: Deux études de cas	2000
114	Zarate	Identities and plurilingualism: preconditions for the recognition of intercultural competences	2003